

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th
September, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)

County Councillors: J. Becker, D. Blakebrough, L. Brown, D. Dovey,
D. Evans, M. Feakins, R. Harris, J. Higginson, G. Howard,
P. Murphy, M. Powell and A. Webb

County Councillor M. Feakins joined the meeting during the presentation of application DM/2018/01089.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Mark Hand	Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Craig O'Connor	Development Management Area Team Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
John Rogers	Legal Officer
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

County Councillors P. Clarke and A. Davies

1. Declarations of Interest

County Councillor R. Edwards declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DC/2018/00096, as she is related to a neighbour of the application site. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 7th August 2018 were confirmed and signed by the Chair, subject to the following amendments:

Minute 6 - Application DM/2018/00528

Seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins

Minute 7 – Application DM/2018/00695

Seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th
September, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

3. APPLICATION DC/2017/01391 - CHANGE OF USE OF THE FIRST FLOOR FROM OFFICES (USE CLASS B1A) TO FOUR FLATS (USE CLASS C3). 4 WESLEY BUILDINGS, CALDICOT

We considered the report of the application, and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Councillor A. Easson, representing Caldicot Town Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and informed the Committee that as there was to be a parking permit allocated to each of the proposed four flats at the Waitrose car park then the concerns of the Town Council would be addressed.

The applicant's agent, Ms. S. Hartrey, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair. In light of the information received regarding the allocation of parking permits to each of the four proposed flats, the applicant's agent had no further information for the Committee.

Reference was made to condition one and the commencement of development within five years. It was suggested that the condition should be amended to commence development within three years to enable an earlier review of the viability situation if development is not commenced, as recommended by the District Valuer.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor G. Howard and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2017/01391 be approved subject to the two conditions, with condition one being amended to commence development within three years to enable an earlier review of the viability situation if development is not commenced, as recommended by the District Valuer.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2017/01391 be approved subject to the two conditions, with condition one being amended to commence development within three years to enable an earlier review of the viability situation if development is not commenced, as recommended by the District Valuer.

4. APPLICATION DC/2018/00096 - ERECTION OF NEW DETACHED DWELLING HOUSE. 6 CAESTORY AVENUE, RAGLAN, MONMOUTHSHIRE, NP15 2EH

We considered the report of the application which was presented for refusal for one reason.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th September, 2018 at 2.00 pm

This application had been presented to Planning Committee on 3rd July 2018 with a recommendation for approval. However, the Planning Committee subsequently deferred the application to seek a reduction in the height and massing of the proposed new dwelling.

The applicant considered that the development accorded with Local Development Plan Policy and was acceptable and did not wish to make any amendments to the proposed dwelling. As such, the application is now recommended for refusal for the following reason:

- The proposed dwelling is considered to be out of keeping with the character and appearance of the local area by virtue of its excessive height, scale and massing and is therefore contrary to the adopted Monmouthshire Local Development Plan Policies S13, S17 and DES1 b), c) and I).

The Committee expressed its disappointment that the applicant had not considered making any amendments to the application. It was therefore proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2018/00096 be refused for the one reason, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	10
Against refusal	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2018/00096 be refused for the one reason, as outlined in the report.

5. APPLICATION DM/2018/00707 - APPLICATION TO RETAIN AMENDMENTS TO APPROVED APPLICATION DC/2017/00728. (SITE 4). RESIDENTIAL QUARTERS REDCHILLIES THAI AND INDIAN RESTAURANT FIVE LANES NORTH.FIVE LANES CAERWENT

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented for refusal for one reason.

The application had been deferred at the Planning Committee meeting on 7th August 2018 to be refused, contrary to the recommendation of officers. The application is therefore re-presented to Committee with a recommendation for refusal.

The Committee's concerns related to the scale and position of the garage element of the proposal. The reason for refusal offered to reflect those concerns is as follows:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th September, 2018 at 2.00 pm

- The scale and mass of the garage as built is excessive, its layout pushed forward of the common building line of this development is out of character in relation to the remainder of the development and it has an unacceptable overbearing effect on the amenity of the neighbouring dwelling to the east, conflicting with Policies S17, DES1 b), c), and d) and EP1 of the adopted Monmouthshire Local Development Plan.

The local Member for Caerwent, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- His views expressed at the August 2018 meeting of Planning Committee in respect of this application had not changed.
- Since the last meeting, further representations had been received from members of the public expressing their concerns regarding this development.
- The development had not complied with the planning permission that had been granted.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, the following points were noted:

- Some Members considered that the development had not resulted in loss of amenity by the standards that the Committee had established in previous planning application decisions made and considered that there was no reason to refuse the application.
- Other Members considered that if the application had initially been presented to the Committee in its current form, the Committee would most likely have refused the application.
- The development disrupts the street scene.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor L. Brown that application DM/2018/00707 be refused for the reason outlined in the report and that the Authority takes enforcement action.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	8
Against refusal	-	4
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2018/00707 be refused for the reason outlined in the report and that the Authority takes enforcement action.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th
September, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

**6. APPLICATION DM/2018/01048 - REPLACEMENT DETACHED GARAGE.
SWALLOW HILL, PROSPECT ROAD, MONMOUTH, NP25 3SZ**

We considered the report of the application, and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor P Murphy and seconded by County Councillor D. Evans that application DM/2018/01048 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2018/01048 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

**7. APPLICATION DM/2018/01089 - CONVERSION OF TWO AGRICULTURAL
BARNs AND ASSOCIATED OUTBUILDINGS TO RESIDENTIAL USE. NEW
TRECASTLE FARM TRECASTLE ROAD LLANGOVAN MONMOUTHSHIRE,
NP25 4BW**

We considered the report of the application, and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 financial contribution of £54,321 for affordable housing in the area.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor L. Brown and seconded by County Councillor G. Howard that we be minded to defer consideration of application DM/2018/01089 to a future meeting of Planning Committee to consider proposals against Policy H4 (business use) and to clarify future intentions for a nearby silage pit and an existing agricultural building that is to be retained having regard to the amenity of the occupiers of the proposed dwellings.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of deferral	-	12
Against deferral	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that we be minded to defer consideration of application DM/2018/01089 to a future meeting of Planning Committee to consider proposals against Policy H4

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th
September, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

(business use) and to clarify future intentions for a nearby silage pit and an existing agricultural building that is to be retained having regard to the amenity of the occupiers of the proposed dwellings.

The meeting ended at 3.23 pm.